

P23-14, Non-Cost Max Points Available: 50 for all phases of non-cost	Amerigas	Ferrellgas	MJ Propane	Thompson Gas
Phase One Evaluation Vendor Responsiveness & Mandatory Requirements (Pass / Fail) Vendors not receiving passing grade will not be considered for Phase 2 evaluation	Pass	Pass	Pass	Fail - Vendor response did not address the key elements and criteria requested in the RFP document.
Phase Two Evaluation Vendor Qualifications & References Points Available 10 - Must receive a non-cost score of 70% or better to be considered for Phase 3 evaluation	100%	100%	60% - Marginal - Only provided 2 references that were not of similar size and scope.	
Phase Two Points	10	10	6	
Phase Two Summary and Rationale: Vendors scoring 70% or better of pts available advanced to Phase Three Notes: Non-Cost Determined Utilizing Scoring Matrix Relative to Points Available: Excellent=100%, Very Good= 90%, Good=80%, Adequate=70%, Marginal=60%, Poor=25%, Unacceptable=0%	Advanced to Phase Three	Advanced to Phase Three	Did not advance to Phase 3	
Phase Three Evaluation (General Book Review Non-Cost/Scope of Work of Special T&C 10 Points Available	100% - Excellent	100% Excellent		
Phase Three Points	10	10		
Phase Four Evaluation Vendor Presentation and overall comprehensive analysis of offer based on all phases evaluated. 30 Points Available	60% Marginal - Vendor was not prepared to discuss all aspects of the RFP to include pricing methodology. Did not have information regarding price index. FCS was looking for additional feedback on lease versus ownership.	90% Very Good		
Phase Four Points	18	27		
Total Non-Cost Points	38	47		
Cost Evaluation Note: The cost evaluation and point allocation below represents a solution where FCS purchases a used tank with new equipment and the purchase of propane during the contract year. FCS determined it was in our best interest to purchase and not lease equipment under this RFP.				
Cost Points: 50 Available (See Cost Finalist Tab for Calculation)	47.94	47.94		
Total Points: 100 Available	85.94	94.94		

P23-14, Propane Cost Analysis (Purchase of Tank & Equipment Solution Only)		Ferrell Gas		Amerigas	
Propane / (10 Points Available)	Gallons Purchased	Mark Up Per Gallon Over Milner Index	Extended Cost	Mark Up Per Gallon Over Milner Index	Extended Cost
Bulk Propane Purchase FCS Owned Tank & Equipment	47000	\$0.34	\$15,980.00	\$0.27	\$12,690.00
Points Earned		7.94		10.00	
Tank & Equipment (38 Points Available)		Total Cost		Total Cost	
Turn-Key Used Tank & Equipment (FCS Owned)		\$222,431.00		\$229,575.00	
Points Earned		38.00		36.80	
Service & Repairs (2 Points Available)		Cost Per Hour		Cost Per Hour	
Service & Repairs during the contract period when purchasing propane. Estimated 10 Hours		\$125 @ 10 Hours = \$1250		\$220 @ 10 Hours = \$2200	
Points Earned		2.00		1.14	
Total Points		47.94		47.94	

P23-14, Propane Cost Analysis		Ferrell Gas		Amerigas	
Propane	Gallons Purchased	Mark Up Per Gallon Over Milner Index	Extended Cost	Mark Up Per Gallon Over Milner Index	Extended Cost
Bulk Propane Purchase FCS Owned Tank & Equipment	47000	\$0.34	\$15,980.00	\$0.27	\$12,690.00
Tank & Equipment		Total Cost		Total Cost	
Turn-Key Used Tank & Equipment (FCS Owned)		\$222,431.00		\$229,575.00	
Service & Repairs		Cost Per Hour		Cost Per Hour	
Service & Repairs during the contract period when purchasing propane.		\$125.00		\$220.00	
Total Cost		\$238,411.00		\$242,265.00	